

## On the approval of the Rules for awarding degrees

Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated March 31, 2011 No. 127. Registered with the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan on May 13, 2011 No. 6951.

#### On the approval of the Rules for awarding degrees

Footnote. The heading is as amended by the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 28, 2018 No. 512 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

Note RCPI!

For the procedure for putting the order into effect, see clause 5.

In order to implement subparagraph 14) of Article 4 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 18, 2011 "On Science", **I ORDER**:

1. Approve the Rules for awarding degrees in accordance with Appendix 1 to this order.

Footnote. Paragraph 1 - as amended by the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 28, 2018 No. 512 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

- 2. To the Committee for Control in the Sphere of Education and Science (Bektemesov M.A.):
- 1) ensure in the prescribed manner the state registration of this order with the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan;
- 2) after state registration, publish this order in the media.
- 3. Recognize invalid some orders of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan in accordance with Appendix 2 to this order.
- 4. To impose control over the execution of this order on the Vice-Minister Orunkhanov M.K.
- 5. This order shall enter into force upon the expiration of ten calendar days from the date of the first official publication.

Minister B. Zhumagulov

Annex 1

to the order of the Minister of Education and science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated March 31, 2011 No. 127

#### Degree award rules

Footnote. The heading is as amended by the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 28, 2018 No. 512 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

Footnote. Rules - as amended by the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 25, 2016 No. 468 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

#### **Chapter 1. General Provisions**

1. These Rules for awarding degrees (hereinafter - the Rules) are developed in accordance with subparagraph 14) of Article 4 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 18, 2011 "On Science" (hereinafter - the Law "On Science") and determine the procedure for awarding the degrees of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Doctors by profile.

Footnote. Paragraph 1 - as amended by the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 28, 2018 No. 512 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

- 2. The following concepts are used in the Rules:
- 1) attestation case a package of documents submitted for awarding the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Doctor in profile to the Committee for Quality Assurance in Science and Higher Education of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan (hereinafter referred to as the Committee);
- 2) doctor by profile a degree awarded to persons who have mastered the doctoral program in the relevant field of professional activity and defended a dissertation in the Republic of Kazakhstan or abroad, recognized in the manner prescribed by the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" (hereinafter the Law "On Education");
- 3) dissertation a qualifying scientific work defended in the Republic of Kazakhstan or abroad, in a specific specialty within the framework of an educational program for the preparation of a doctor of philosophy (PhD), a doctor in profile;
- 4) Expert Council a consultative and advisory body under the Committee for the relevant scientific direction, which conducts an examination of the dissertation for compliance with the requirements of the Rules and monitors the activities of the dissertation council, as well as conducts examination and monitoring of scientific publications for their compliance with the requirements;
- 5) Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) a degree awarded to persons who have mastered the doctoral program in the scientific and pedagogical direction and defended a

dissertation in the Republic of Kazakhstan or abroad, recognized in the manner prescribed by the Law "On Education".

Footnote. Paragraph 2 - in the wording of the order, acting. Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.01.2023 No. 7 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

3. Doctoral students who defended dissertations in dissertation councils at organizations of higher and (or) postgraduate education of the Republic of Kazakhstan (hereinafter referred to as the university), having a special status, the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), doctors in the profile are awarded by universities with a special status, independently in the order established in Chapter 6 of these Rules.

Doctoral students who defended dissertations in the dissertation councils of universities that do not have a special status, the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), are awarded by the Committee, taking into account the conclusion of the Expert Council (in the form in accordance with Appendix 1 to these Rules) and in the manner established in Chapter 3 of these Rules.

Footnote. Paragraph 3 - as amended by the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 28, 2018 No. 512 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

# Chapter 2. The procedure for awarding the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Doctors by profile

4. The dissertation is carried out under the guidance of domestic and foreign scientific consultants who have academic degrees (candidate of science, doctor of science, doctor of philosophy (PhD), doctor of profile) or academic degrees of doctor of philosophy (PhD), doctor of profile or doctor of philosophy (PhD) ), Doctors by profile and who are specialists in the field of doctoral research.

A dissertation containing state secrets is carried out under the supervision of two domestic scientific consultants who have academic degrees (candidate of science, doctor of science, doctor of philosophy (PhD), doctor of profile) or academic degrees of doctor of philosophy (PhD), doctor of profile or Ph.D. (PhD), doctors in the field and who are specialists in the field of doctoral research, or having a military (special) rank of at least a colonel with at least 5 (five) years of experience in scientific and pedagogical work and actively engaged in scientific research in the field of doctoral research.

The topic of the dissertation (as of the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of development of science, which are formed by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan in accordance with paragraph 3 of Article 18 of the Law "On Science" and / or state

programs (with the exception of dissertations submitted for recognition of equivalence academic degrees obtained abroad by citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan, foreigners and stateless persons).

5. The dissertation is carried out in compliance with the principles of independence, internal unity, scientific novelty, reliability and practical value and academic honesty. The principle of independence means that the thesis is written independently and testifies to the personal contribution of the author of the dissertation to science, the development of engineering and technology.

The principle of internal unity means that the dissertation has internal unity, all sections and provisions of the dissertation are logically interconnected; scientific provisions, the results obtained and recommendations should correspond to the goals and objectives set in the dissertation. The new solutions proposed by the author (principles, methods) are argued and evaluated in comparison with the known solutions.

The principle of scientific novelty means that the scientific results, provisions, recommendations and conclusions of the dissertation are new and the dissertation contains:

new scientifically substantiated theoretical and (or) experimental results, the totality of which qualifies as a new scientific achievement or is important for the development of specific scientific areas;

or scientifically substantiated technical, technological, economic or managerial solutions, the implementation of which makes a significant contribution to the development of the country's economy.

The principle of reliability means that the results of the dissertation work are obtained using modern methods of scientific research and methods of processing and interpreting data using computer technology (if applicable); for dissertations made in natural, technical, medical, agricultural specialties, theoretical conclusions, models, identified relationships and patterns are proven and confirmed by experimental research; for the specialties of the "Education" group, the results are proved on the basis of a pedagogical experiment (if applicable).

The principle of reliability means that the results of the dissertation work are obtained using proper scientific methods of scientific research and methods of processing and interpreting data using computer technology (if applicable); for dissertations made in natural, technical, medical, agricultural specialties, theoretical conclusions, models, identified relationships and patterns are proven and confirmed by experimental research, and conclusions based on the results of experiments are reproducible and (or)

statistically reliable; for the specialties of the "Education" group, the results are proved on the basis of a pedagogical experiment (if applicable).

The principle of academic honesty means that the author of the dissertation observes the rights and legitimate interests of other authors, the absence of:

- use and (or) appropriation of text, ideas, hypotheses, conclusions, methods, research results, graphs, codes, pictures or works of other authors without reference to the author and source of borrowing, as well as the use of text of other authors with a synonymous replacement of words and expressions without changes in meaning, including the use of text translated from another language (plagiarism);
- facts of using own material, factual and digital data without reference to oneself and (or) to the source of one's own citations (autoplagiarism);
- references to non-existent sources, provision of false data and (or) results, records or reports about them (fabrication);
- manipulation of research materials, equipment, images, illustrations or processes, as a result of which the research materials in the dissertation are distorted (falsification).

The coincidence of the names of regulatory legal acts and official documents, the names of state and other official bodies and organizations, terms, definitions and concepts generally accepted for the relevant branch of science, texts of regulatory legal acts, texts of the studied works is not plagiarism, if the volume and nature of their use are not put under doubt the independence of the completed dissertation. It is not allowed to use technical means and techniques in order to reduce or eliminate the possibility of detecting plagiarism.

Footnote. Clause 5 as amended by orders of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 30, 2020 No. 170 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication); and about. Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.01.2023 No. 7 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

- 5-1. The dissertation is submitted in one of the following forms:
- 1) dissertation work;
- 2) a series of at least two articles and one review or three articles published in publications included in the first and / or second quartile in terms of impact factor according to Journal Citation Reports (Journal Citation Reports) of Clarivate Analytics (Clariwait Analytics). In one of the articles, the doctoral candidate is the first author or corresponding author.

When fulfilling the requirements of this paragraph, the requirements of paragraph 6 do not apply to the doctoral student.

Footnote. The rules are supplemented by paragraph 5-1 in accordance with the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.03.2021 No. 98 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication); as amended by and about. Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.01.2023 No. 7 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

6. The main scientific results of the dissertation for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Doctor of profile are published before the defense of the dissertation in scientific publications included in the List of scientific publications recommended for the publication of the main results of scientific activity (hereinafter referred to as the List of Publications), and (or) in an international peer-reviewed scientific journal.

An international peer-reviewed scientific journal has an impact factor according to the Journal Citation Reports (Journal Citation Reports) (hereinafter referred to as JCR) and is indexed in the Web of Science Core Collection database (Web of Science Core Collection) (sections Arts and Humanities Citation Index (Art and Humanities Citeishen Index), Science Citation Index Expanded (Science Citeishen Index Expanded), Social Sciences Citation Index (Social Science Citeishen Index) of Clarivate Analytics or has a certain CiteScore percentile (SiteSkor) in the Scopus database (Scopus).

Requirements for publications for admission to protection:

- at least 1 (one) article (article) or review (review) in an international peer-reviewed scientific journal that has an impact factor according to JCR (JSR) and is indexed in the Web of Science Core Collection database (Web of Science Core Collection) (Sections Arts and Humanities Citation Index (Arts and Humanities Citation Index), Science Citation Index Expanded (Science Citation Index Expanded), Social Sciences Citation Index (Social Science Citation Index)) or CiteScore percentile indicator (SiteScore) of at least 25 (twenty-five) in the Scopus database (Scopus) and 3 (three) articles in journals from the List of Publications;
- or at least 1 (one) article (article) in an international peer-reviewed scientific journal indexed in the Web of Science Core Collection database (Web of Science Core Collection) (sections Arts and Humanities Citation Index (Arts and Humanities Citation Index), Science Citation Index Expanded (Science Citation Index Expandid), Social Sciences Citation Index (Social Science Citation Index) and included in the first two quartiles in terms of impact factor according to JCR (ZhSR) or percentile according to CiteScore (SiteScore) of at least 35 (thirty five) in the Scopus database (Scopus);

- either at least 2 (two) articles (article) or 1 (one) article (article) and 1 (one) review (review) in international peer-reviewed scientific journals indexed in the Web of Science Core Collection database (Web of Science Core Collection) (sections Arts and Humanities Citation Index (Arts End Humanities Citation Index), Science Citation Index Expanded (Science Citation Index Expandid), Social Sciences Citation Index (Social Science Citation Index) and included in the first three quartiles by impact factor according to data JCR (JSR) or having a CiteScore percentile (SiteScore) of at least 35 (thirty-five) in the Scopus database (Scopus);
- or the presence of a chapter in a monograph (the doctoral student owns at least 3 printed sheets), which was published by Elsevier (Elsevier), Brill (Brill), CRC Press (CPC Press), DeGruyter (DeGruyter), Edward Elgar Publishing (Edward Elgar Publishing), John Wiley & Sons (John Wiley and Sons), McGraw Hill (Macrow Hill), Palgrave Macmillan (Palgrave Macmillan), Peter Lang (Peter Lang), Prentice Hall (Prentice Hall), Routledge (Routledge), Sage Publications (Sage Publication), Springer Nature (Springer Neychar), Taylor and Francis (Taylor and Francis), Wolters Kluwer (Volters Kluwer) (hereinafter referred to as trusted publishers) or in the university publishing house from the top 100 of the US News Best Global Universities Rankings (US News Best Global Universities Ranking) or Academic Ranking of World Universities (Academician Rankin of World University).

At the same time, for educational programs related to the Kazakh language and literature, Kazakh philology, the history of Kazakhstan, the Kazakh philosophy of groups of educational programs (hereinafter - GOP) "8D017 - Training of teachers of the Kazakh language and literature", "D016 - Training of teachers of history" and "8D060 - Philology", "D050 - Philosophy and Ethics" and "D053 - History" training areas 8D01 Pedagogical Sciences and 8D02 Arts and Humanities for admission to the defense, the presence of:

- at least 1 (one) article or review in an international peer-reviewed scientific journal indexed in the Web of Science Core Collection database (Web of Science Core Collection) under the Arts and Humanities Citation Index (Art and Humanities Citation Index) or having a percentile indicator according to CiteScore (SiteSkor) at least 25 (twenty five) in the Scopus database (Scopus) and 3 (three) articles in journals from the List of Publications;
- or at least 5 (five) articles in journals from the List of Publications, one of which is in English, and 2 (two) oral presentations at international scientific conferences.

If there is one scientific article in a journal that is included in the first quartile in terms of impact factor according to JCR (JSR) or has a CiteScore percentile (CiteScore) of at least 75, no other publications are required.

Publications in international peer-reviewed scientific journals, conference proceedings correspond to the content of the dissertation and the thematic focus of the journal and conference declared in the specified databases, are published on the official website of the journal, in current issues and have the type Article (Article), Review (Review) or Article in Press (Article in press), Conference Paper, Proceedings. Publication in international peer-reviewed scientific journals with an interdisciplinary direction (Multidisciplinary) is allowed.

If the indexation of an international peer-reviewed scientific journal in the Scopus and/or Web of Science database is terminated due to violations, then the applicant's publications in this journal for the year in which indexation was terminated and for the previous year are not taken into account.

The journal quartile in the Web of Science database and (or) the CiteScore percentile in the Scopus database is taken into account for the year of publication or for the year preceding the year of publication.

When defending dissertations containing state secrets or information for official use, the main results of the dissertation are published in at least 7 (seven) publications on the topic of the dissertation, including at least 4 (four) articles in scientific publications, included in the List of publications.

For persons who have defended dissertations abroad, scientific papers (including 1 (one) article in an international peer-reviewed scientific journal) published on the topic of the dissertation before submitting the attestation case to the Committee are taken into account. As an article in a journal from the List of Publications, articles in foreign scientific periodicals are taken into account.

Footnote. Paragraph 6 - as amended by the order. Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.01.2023 No. 7 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

6-1. OVPO independently establishes requirements for the design of dissertations, including international citation styles used in dissertations (Harvard style (Harvard style), APA (American Psychological Association) Style (APA Style), MLA (Modern Language Association) Style (MLA Style), Chicago Style (Chicago Style), ACS (American Chemical Society) Style (ACS Style) or others depending on the direction of training).

Footnote. The rules are supplemented by paragraph 6-1 in accordance with the order of the acting. Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of

Kazakhstan dated 09.01.2023 No. 7 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

- 7. In the dissertation, references are noted:
- 1) sources of cited materials or individual results, indicating the full imprint;
- 2) titles of protection for developments received by the doctoral candidate independently or in co-authorship;
- 3) scientific papers on the topic of the dissertation, performed by the doctoral candidate independently or in co-authorship.

If plagiarism is detected in the dissertation, the dissertation council or the Committee makes a negative decision without the right to re-defend.

Footnote. Paragraph 7 - as amended by the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.03.2021 No. 98 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

#### Chapter 3

Footnote. The heading of chapter 3 is as amended by the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 28, 2018 No. 512 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

8. The term for consideration of attestation cases submitted to the Committee by the dissertation council in accordance with paragraph 20 of the Model regulation on the dissertation council, approved by order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated March 31, 2011 No. 126 (hereinafter referred to as the Model regulation on the dissertation council) (registered in Register of State Registration of Normative Legal Acts under No. 6929) is 4 (four) months from the date of their registration with the Committee. When a doctoral student is invited to a meeting of the Expert Council, the consideration period is extended by 1 (one) month. The Committee informs the dissertation council about the extension of the consideration period within 7 (seven) working days from the date of the extension.

An attestation case is withdrawn from the consideration of the Committee within 1 (one) month from the moment of its receipt in the presence of a personal application (in any form) of a doctoral candidate or a petition of the dissertation council (in any form). In case of withdrawal from consideration, the attestation case is submitted to the Committee after a second defense.

Footnote. Clause 8 as amended by Order No. 170 of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 30, 2020 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

9. Compliance of dissertations with the requirements of the Rules is established by the Committee on the basis of the conclusion of the Expert Council in the relevant areas of training.

Footnote. Paragraph 9 - as amended by the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 30, 2020 No. 170 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

10. Expert councils include specialists who have an academic degree (candidate of science, doctor of science, doctor of philosophy (PhD), doctor of profile) or academic degree of doctor of philosophy (PhD), doctor of profile or degree of doctor of philosophy (PhD), doctor by profile.

Members of the Expert Council (at least 1/3 (one third) have a citation index - Hirsch index 2 (two) or more in the international citation systems Web of Science (Web of Science) or Scopus (Scopus); and (or) publications in international peer-reviewed scientific journals indexed in the Web of Science Core Collection database (Web of Science Core Collection) (sections Arts and Humanities Citation Index, Science Citation Index Expanded, Social Sciences Citation Index (Social Science Citation Index) and included in the 1st (first), 2nd (second) and 3rd (third) quartile in terms of impact factor according to JCR (SCR) or having a CiteScore percentile of at least 35 in the Scopus information database (Scopus); and (or) international patents; and (or) at least 10 (ten) publications in publications from the List of Publications); and (or) 10 (ten) scientific and (or) creative works (in the direction of art).

Counted as 2 (two) scientific articles in international peer-reviewed scientific journals monograph (the candidate owns at least 3 printed sheets), which was published by Elsevier (Elsevier), Brill (Brill), CRC Press (CPC Press), DeGruyter (DeGruyter), Edward Elgar Publishing, John Wiley & Sons, McGraw Hill, McGraw Hill, Palgrave Macmillan, Peter Lang, Prentice Hall, Routledge (Routledge), Sage Publications (Sage Publication), Springer Nature (Springer Neychar), Taylor and Francis (Taylor and Francis), Wolters Kluwer (Volters Kluver) (hereinafter referred to as trusted publishers) or from a university publisher from the top 100 US News Best ranking Global Universities Rankings (US News Best Global Universities Rankins) or Academic Ranking of World Universities (Academician Rankin of World Universities) or Times Higher Education World University (Times Hair Education World University). If there is a chapter in the above monograph (the candidate owns at least 1 printed sheet), it is counted as 1 (one) article in an international peer-reviewed scientific journal.

The composition of the Expert Councils does not include the first heads of the OVPO and civil servants (with the exception of representatives of military, special

educational institutions or scientific organizations subordinate to the national security bodies of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Ministry of Emergency Situations of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the prosecution authorities of the Republic of Kazakhstan and Ministry of Defense of the Republic of Kazakhstan), as well as chairmen and members of dissertation councils at universities that do not have a special status.

If the specialists meet the requirements of this paragraph, the Committee approves the composition of the Expert Councils for a period of 3 (three) years. One Expert Council includes at least 6 (six) people. Members of the Expert Councils cannot perform their functions for more than 2 (two) terms in a row. In case of absence from meetings of the Expert Council more than 3 (three) times in 1 (one) year or improper performance of their duties, a member of the Expert Council is excluded.

The Chairman, Deputy Chairman and Academic Secretary are appointed to the Expert Council, who are not representatives of one organization.

Members of the Expert Council carry out an examination of attestation cases on a reimbursable basis in the manner prescribed by the civil legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Footnote. Clause 10 - as amended by the order. Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.01.2023 No. 7 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

- 11. The functions of the Expert Council are:
- 1) examination of attestation files, dissertations and publications for compliance with the requirements of the Rules and the Model Regulations on the dissertation council;
- 2) examination and monitoring of journals for inclusion in the list (or exclusion from the list) of scientific publications recommended for publication of the main results of scientific activity;
- 3) analysis and monitoring of the work of dissertation councils;
- 4) consideration of proposals and preparation of recommendations for improving the training of doctors of philosophy (PhD), doctors in the profile.
- 5) preparation of recommendations on research methods and academic writing. Footnote. Clause 11 as amended by the order. Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.01.2023 No. 7 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).
- 12. Meetings of the Expert Council are held under the leadership of the Chairman of the Expert Council, in his absence the Deputy Chairman.

Meetings are considered eligible if there are at least 2/3 (two-thirds) of its approved membership.

Based on the decision of the Committee, it is allowed to hold a meeting of the Expert Council in the form of a videoconference. This provides:

visual identification of meeting participants;

continuous video and audio broadcasting of the speeches of the meeting participants.

The participation of the members of the Expert Council is confirmed by the attendance sheet of the meeting of the Expert Council in accordance with Appendix 2 to these Rules.

The working materials of the expert councils are stored in the Committee.

Footnote. Paragraph 12 - as amended by the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.03.2021 No. 98 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

- 12-1. The Expert Council by open voting takes one of the following decisions:
- 1) to award the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) or Doctor of Science;
- 2) send the dissertation for revision (except in cases of defending a dissertation in the form of a series of articles);
- 3) send the dissertation for re-defense;
- 4) refuse to award the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) or Doctor of Science.

The decision of the Expert Council on awarding the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) or Doctor of profile is considered adopted if 3/4 (three quarters) or more of the members of the Expert Council present at the meeting voted for it. The decision of the Expert Council to refuse to award the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) or a doctor in the field, to send the dissertation for revision or re-defense is considered adopted if 2/3 (two-thirds) or more of the members of the Expert Council present at the meeting voted for it. If the specified number of votes is not obtained, then a second voting is held, at which a decision is made to send the dissertation for revision or for re-defense, if the majority of the members of the council present at the meeting voted for it. In the event of an equality in the number of votes in the second vote, the dissertation is sent for a second defense.

The dissertation work is sent for revision if it contains minor comments on the text, the correction of which does not change the essence of the work. If the dissertation does not comply with paragraph 4 and (or) 6 of these Rules (or) partially complies with the principles (except for the principle of academic integrity) specified in paragraph 5 of these Rules, then it is sent for re-defense. In case of violation of the principle of academic honesty or non-compliance with the principles of scientific

novelty, internal unity, reliability of the dissertation, a decision is made to refuse to award the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) or Doctor of Specialization.

When deciding to send the dissertation for revision, the conclusion of the Expert Council (Appendix 1 to these Rules) contains specific comments on the dissertation work.

Footnote. The rules are supplemented by paragraph 12-1 in accordance with the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.03.2021 No. 98 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication); in the wording of the order and about. Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.01.2023 No. 7 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

- 13. In the absence of a specialist in the field of doctoral research, applicant in the Expert Council, the expert council sends a dissertation to an external expert with an academic degree (candidate of science, doctor of science, doctor of philosophy (PhD), doctor of profile) or an academic degree of doctor of philosophy (PhD), doctor by profile or degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Doctor by profile. Also, based on the decision of the Expert Council, the doctoral candidate is invited to the meeting of the Expert Council.
- 14. Within 10 (ten) working days from the date of adoption of the opinion by the Expert Council, the Committee issues an appropriate order to send the dissertation for revision or re-defense, or to award / refuse to award the doctoral student the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Doctor in profile.

In the event of a decision to send for revision, re-defense or refusal to award the doctoral student the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Doctor in profile, the Committee sends the conclusion of the expert council to the dissertation council and the doctoral student within 10 working days from the date of issuance of the order.

The finalized dissertation work is submitted to the expert council within three months, which can be extended for no more than 3 (three) months. The decision to extend the revision period is made by the expert council based on the application of the doctoral student in any form. If the finalized dissertation work is not submitted within the established timeframe, the doctoral student undergoes a second defense.

The expert council discusses the finalized dissertation work in order to eliminate the comments of the expert council, after which a decision is made by a relative majority of votes to award a degree or send it for re-defense. Re-protection is carried out no earlier than 6 (six) months after the previous protection.

Footnote. Paragraph 14 - as amended by the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.03.2021 No. 98 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

15. In case of refusal to award the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Doctor of the profile, the dissertation is submitted by the doctoral candidate for defense again, but not earlier than 6 (six) months after the previous defense.

If a violation of the dissertation defense procedure established in the Model Regulations on the Dissertation Council is detected, the Committee sends comments to the Dissertation Council within 2 (two) working days. In this case, the attestation case is subject to consideration in the manner prescribed by these Rules.

Footnote. Clause 15 as amended by orders of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 28, 2018 No. 512 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication); dated 09.03.2021 No. 98 (shall be enforced upon the expiration of ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

- 16. When a negative decision is made, information is posted on the Internet resources of the Committee and the university in which the dissertation was prepared, indicating the reason for making such a decision, as well as information about scientific consultants, the dissertation council and official reviewers. When making a negative decision on dissertations containing state secrets, information is not posted on the Internet resources of the Committee and the university. When a positive decision is made by the Committee after the repeated defense of the dissertation, information about the negative decision is removed from the Internet resource of the university and the Committee.
- 17. Persons who have been awarded the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Doctor in profile, are issued state diplomas in the form approved by the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 28, 2015 No. 39 "On approval of the types and forms of documents on education of the state sample and Rules for their issuance" (registered in the Register of State Registration of Regulatory Legal Acts under No. 10348) (hereinafter Order No. 39). Information on awarding the degree is posted on the Internet resources of the

Information on awarding the degree is posted on the Internet resources of the Committee within 3 (three) working days from the date of the decision.

18. Dissertations and publications submitted for consideration by the Expert Council within the framework of the state service "Recognition of documents on education", approved by order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 19, 2021 No. 352 "On approval of the Rules for the recognition of documents on education, as well as a list of foreign organizations of higher and (or)

postgraduate education whose education documents are recognized on the territory of the Republic of Kazakhstan" (registered in the Register of State Registration of Normative Legal Acts under No. 23626), are considered for compliance with paragraphs 5, 7 and 10 of these Rules within 36 working days.

In the event of a negative conclusion of the Expert Council due to non-compliance with paragraphs 5 and 10 of the Rules, the dissertation of the applicant is not subject to re-consideration.

Footnote. Clause 18 - as amended by the order. Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.01.2023 No. 7 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

# Chapter 4. Awarding the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), doctors by profile, persons who defended their thesis for abroad

- 19. Excluded by order of acting. Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.01.2023 No. 7 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).
- 20. Excluded by order of acting. Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.01.2023 No. 7 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).
- 21. Excluded by order of acting. Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.01.2023 No. 7 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).
- 22. Excluded by order of acting. Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.01.2023 No. 7 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).
- 23. Excluded by order of acting. Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.01.2023 No. 7 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).
- 24. Excluded by order of acting. Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.01.2023 No. 7 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).
- 25. Excluded by order of acting. Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.01.2023 No. 7 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

26. Excluded by order of acting. Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.01.2023 No. 7 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

## **Chapter 5 Consideration of Appeals**

- 27. The decision of the dissertation council and the Committee to refuse to award the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Doctor in profile within 60 (sixty) calendar days from the date of issuance of the doctoral student's order, the applicant may file an appeal. The appeal is submitted to the dissertation council, which decided to refuse to award the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Doctor of Specialization, or to the Committee. After the expiration of the specified period, the appeal will not be accepted for consideration.
- 28. For the pre-trial settlement of disputes on the issues of awarding the degrees of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Doctor in profile, the Committee, within 1 (one) month from the date of filing the appeal, creates an appeal commission (hereinafter referred to as the commission) consisting of 2 (two) representatives of the Committee and 3 (three) scientists in the relevant specialty who are not scientific consultants, reviewers, members of the dissertation or Expert Councils.

The Commission considers the appeal, materials of the attestation case and prepares an opinion on the results of the appeal within 30 (thirty) calendar days from the date of its creation.

The issue of inviting a doctoral student or applicant to the meeting is decided by the Commission independently.

Footnote. Paragraph 28 - as amended by the order. Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.01.2023 No. 7 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

- 29. The conclusion of the appeal commission is adopted by the members of the commission on the basis of an open vote by a majority of votes and signed by all members of the commission.
- 30. The Commission is guided in its activities by the Rules, the Model Regulations on the Dissertation Council.
- 31. From the date of signing the conclusion of the Appeal Commission, the Committee, within 15 (fifteen) calendar days, issues an appropriate order to award / refuse to award the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Doctor in profile and informs the applicant about it. The conclusion of the appeal commission is

communicated to the applicant in accordance with the procedures of the Administrative Procedure Code.

Footnote. Paragraph 31 - as amended by the order. Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.01.2023 No. 7 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

32. Disputes not settled by the Rules, including on the issues of refusal to award the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), doctor in profile, restoration of the deadline for filing an appeal, are resolved in court.

#### Chapter 6

Footnote. The rules are supplemented by chapter 6 in accordance with the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 28, 2018 No. 512 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

- 33. A university with a special status, on the basis of the decision of the dissertation council, issues an appropriate order to award (refuse to award) a doctoral student the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) or a doctor in the profile within 10 (ten) working days from the date of the decision.
- 34. Persons who have been awarded the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), doctor in the profile by order of a university with a special status, are issued diplomas of their own sample within 5 (five) working days from the date of issuance of the order.

Information on the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Doctor of profile is posted on the Internet resource of universities with a special status, within 3 (three) working days from the date of the decision of the dissertation council.

- 35. The procedure for issuing a diploma conferring the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), doctor in the field in universities with a special status, is determined by them independently.
- 36. In case of refusal to award the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), doctor of the profile, the dissertation is submitted by the doctoral candidate for defense again, but not earlier than one year after the previous defense at a university with a special status. Annex 1

to the Rules for awarding degrees

Footnote. Appendix 1 - as amended by the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.03.2021 No. 98 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

Form

Conclusion of the Expert Council on
protocol No dated "" 20
Listened:
Case No
on the decision of the dissertation council
deted " " O (Minutes No. ) at the request
dated ""20 (Minutes No) at the request on awarding the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Doctor in profile
<del></del>
(last name, first name, patronymic (if any) of a doctoral student)
based on the defense of a dissertation on the topic
<del></del>
in the specialty / direction of personnel training
After listening to the expert and
discussing
case materials, the Expert Council notes the following:
1. Correspondence of the topic of the dissertation to the priority directions of the
development of science
and / or government programs that are implemented in
Republic of Kazakhstan
<del></del>
2. Compliance with the principle of independence in the dissertation

3. Compli	ance with the	principle	of interr	nal unity in the dis	sertation	
4. Compli scientific		principle	of scien	tific novelty in the	dissertation	n, the main
5. Compli	ance with the	principle	of reliab	oility in the dissert	ation	
6 Compli	ance with the	nrinciple	e of practi	ical value in the di	ssertation:	
_	rtation has pra		_			
	e whatever ap					
The	results	of	the	dissertation	are	implemented

For implementation in practice, the following are proposed (practical and / or
theoretical proposals for the use of scientific results):
<u></u>
<del></del>
<u></u>
7. Compliance with the principle of academic honesty in the dissertation, the presence
borrowed material in the dissertation without reference to the author and source
borrowing (plagiarism)
(have or not)
In the presence of plagiarism, a comparative table is provided indicating the source
borrowing.
8. Compliance with the completeness of publications:
on the topic of the dissertation published:
total scientific papers;
including:
in publications included in the List of publications;
in international peer-reviewed journals with a non-zero impact factor
or indexed in the database of information company Clarivate Analytics
(Clarivat Analytics) (Web of Science Core Collection, Clarivate Analytics (Web of
Science Core Collection, Clarivate Analytics));
included in the Scopus database (Scopus);
foreign patents included in the Clarivate Analytics database
Analytics) (Web of Science Core Collection, Clarivate Analytics (Web of Science
Core

Collection, Clarivate Analytics);
other publications.
Publicationspoint 6
Rules. (corresponds or does not correspond)
9. Compliance of the materials of the certification case with the requirements of the
Rules
Compliance with the principle of independence from each other of reviewers and scientific consultants
Compliance with the protection procedure in accordance with the Model Regulation on dissertation council
<del></del>
10. Comments to the dissertation council
<del></del>
11. Decision of the Expert Council (one of the subparagraphs is to be filled in):
1) The attestation case and the dissertation of the doctoral candidate meet all the

requirements of these Rules.

Conclusion of the Expert Council - to award
by specialty / area of training
2) The attestation case and the dissertation of the doctoral candidate do not correspond to the paragraph  Rules
(indicate which paragraphs of these Rules does not comply attestation case)
Conclusion of the Expert Council - to refuse a doctoral student
(last name, first name, patronymic (if any) in awarding the degree of doctor Philosophy (PhD), doctor in profile in the specialty / field of study personnel  3) Conclusion of the Expert Council - send the dissertation work of the doctoral
student
(last name, first name, patronymic (if any) for revision to correct
(indicate what needs to be corrected in the dissertation work) 4) Conclusion of the Expert Council - send a doctoral dissertation
(last name, first name, patronymic (if any) for re-defense
(indicate which paragraph of the Rules does not comply with the dissertation)
Voting results: "for"
"against" "abstained"

Chairman	
(signature, (last name, first name, patronymic (if any)	
Scientific Secretary	
(signature, (last name, first name, patronymic (if any)	
Expert	
(signature, (last name, first name, patronymic (if any)	
Annex 2	
to the Rules for awarding	
degrees	
Form	
"I approve"	
Chairman of the Control Committee	
in education and science	
Ministry of Education and Science	
Republic of Kazakhstan	
"" 20	
Warranty sheet	
meetings of the Expert Council	
"" 20	
Surname, name, Object of expertise, Number of hours Signature of	a S
No. p.p. patronymic (if any) number of conclusions Participation in member of	the cl
conclusions conclusions work, hours expert council	ez

Appendix 3
to the Rules for awarding degrees
Form

Conclusion

Footnote. Appendix 3 as amended by the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 24, 2019 No. 230 (shall be enforced ten calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

-	ich on			
Protocol No	<u> </u>		from ""_	20
Listened:				
Case No				
Applicant				
(last name, f	ïrst name, patron	ymic (if any) (h	ereinafter - full name)	)
at	the	request	(personal	application)
on the recog	nition of the equi	ivalence of a de	gree diploma	
by specialty				
received				in
(country, org Dissertation topic	ganization)			
After	listening	5	to the	expert
1. Assessme	liscussed the mat	ance of the dis	e, the Expert Council sertation topic (for pompleted)	_
(compliance practice)	with the develo	pment of science	ce and technology, the	demands of social

2. Compliance with the principle of independence in the dissertation (for persons specified in paragraphs 21 and 22 of the Rules, it is not completed)
<del></del>
3. Compliance with the principle of internal unity in the dissertation (for persons specified in paragraphs 21 and 22 of the Rules, it is not completed)
<del></del>
4. Compliance with the principle of scientific novelty in the dissertation, the main scientific results
(for persons specified in paragraphs 21 and 22 of the Rules, it is not completed)
<del></del>

5. Compliance with the principle of reliability in the dissertation (for persons specified in paragraphs 21 and 22 of the Rules, it is not filled in)
<del></del>
6. Compliance with the principle of practical value in the dissertation (for persons specified in paragraphs 21 and 22 of the Rules is not filled in): the results of the dissertation are implemented
— (industrial implementation, pilot industrial, laboratory tests,
use in the educational process)
; for implementation in practice it is proposed:
(author's certificates, patents, pre-patents, certificate of
intellectual property)
(theoretical recommendations on the use of scientific results)
<del></del>

—. 7. Compliance with the principle of academic honesty in the dissertation, the presence
in the dissertation
borrowed material without reference to the author and source of borrowing
(plagiarism) (for
persons specified in paragraphs 21 and 22 of the Rules is not filled in)
(plagiarism or not)
In the presence of plagiarism, a comparative table is provided indicating the source of borrowing.
8. On the topic of the dissertation published (for persons specified in paragraphs 21 and 22 of the Rules is not completed):
total scientific papers;
including:
in publications recommended by the Committee;
in foreign scientific publications;
in international peer-reviewed journals that have a non-zero impact factor or are
indexed in the database of the information company Clarivate Analytics (Klarivat
Analytics) (Web of Science Core Collection, Clarivate Analytics (Web of Science
Core Collection, Clarivate Analytics));
included in the Scopus database (Scopus);
included in the databases zbMath (zbMat), MathScinet (MatSkynet), Astrophysical
journal (Astrophysical Journal), JSTOR (JAYSTOR);
other publications.
Publications clause 6 of the
Rules.
(corresponds or does not correspond)
9. Availability of a certificate of the Joint Stock Company "Center for International
Programs of the Republic of Kazakhstan" (in any form) on the direction to study in
professional educational programs of postgraduate, doctoral studies (filled in for the
persons specified in subparagraph 1) of paragraph 21 of the Rules)
Availability of documents in accordance with subparagraphs 1), 2), 3), 7), 8), 10), 11)
of paragraph 23:

10. The dissertation is defended (for persons specified in subparagraphs 2), 3) and 4) of paragraph 21 of the Rules):
at a university that is in the top 500 academic rankings (Shanghai Jao Tong University, Times, QS (KSUE)) or the top 200 national universities in the News ranking (News)
(underline as appropriate, indicate the country, university) or at a university of the Russian Federation included in the list of organizations recommended for training for holders of the international scholarship "Bolashak"  :
(name of university) or in a country that is not a member of the Commonwealth of Independent States and the Eurasian economic union
(specify country and university) Availability of documents in accordance with subparagraphs 1), 2), 3), 7), 8), 10) of paragraph 23
<del></del>
11. Availability of a certificate on the appointment of the neck "secret" and / or referral to training programs for the training of scientific and scientific-pedagogical personnel, the authorized body in the field of military education, education in the system of special state and law enforcement agencies (for persons specified in paragraph 22 of the Rules ):
Availability of documents in accordance with subparagraphs 1), 2), 3), 7), 8), 12) of paragraph 23
12. Decision of the Expert Council (one of the subparagraphs is to be filled in):

7	neets all the requirements of the Russian and the meets all the requirements of the Russian and the meets all the requirements of the Russian and the meets all the requirements of the Russian and the meets all the requirements of the Russian and the meets all the requirements of the Russian and the meets all the requirements of the Russian and the requirements and the requirements of the requirements and the requirements are requirements.	-
n the specialty		_ and award a
	degree	_
(Full name (if any).)		
Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Do	octor of profile in the specialty	
D) the appraisal case of the appraisa	plicant does not comply with personan	h of the
z) the appraisal case of the app Rules	plicant does not comply with paragrap	ii or the
it is indicated which paragraph	hs of these Rules do not correspond to	the attestation
,	mends that the Committee refuse	the applicant
	equivalence of the in the	specialty
	r of Philosophy (PhD), doctor in	
Voting results:	"behind"	•
	"against"	
	"abstained"	
Chairman		(Full name (if any).
Scientific Secretary		(Full name (if any).
Expert		(Full name (if any).)

#### Annex 2

to the order of the Minister of Education and science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated March 31, 2011 No. 127

#### Scroll

#### invalidated some orders

#### Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan

1. Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 10, 2003, No. 16 "On Approval of the Rules for Awarding Academic Degrees" (registered in the Register of State Registration of Normative Legal Acts No. 2141, published in the Bulletin of Normative Legal Acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2003, No. 15, art. 842), with the exception of paragraphs 3, 4, 7-12, 35 (part one), 36, 42-44, 50, which become invalid from July 1, 2012.

Footnote. Paragraph 1 as amended by the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated November 25, 2011 No. 492 (shall be enforced after ten calendar days from the date of the first official publication).

- 2. Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated March 1, 2004 No. 159 "On introducing amendments and additions to the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 10, 2003 No. 16 "On approval of the Rules for awarding academic degrees" (registered in the Register of State registration of normative legal acts No. 2724, published in the Bulletin of Normative Legal Acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2005, No. 15, Article 95).
- 3. Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 9, 2004 No. 535 "On introducing amendments and additions to the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 10, 2003 No. 16 "On approval of the Rules for awarding academic degrees" (registered in the Register of State registration of normative legal acts No. 2906, published in the Bulletin of Normative Legal Acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2005, No. 15, Article 97).
- 4. Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 12, 2005 No. 234 "On Amendments to the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 10, 2003 No. 16 "On Approval of the Rules for Awarding Academic Degrees" (registered in the Register of

State Registration of Regulatory legal acts No. 3590, published in the Bulletin of Normative Legal Acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2005, No. 14, Article 75).

5. Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 17, 2007 No. 485 "On amendments and additions to the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 10, 2003 No. 16 "On approval of the Rules for awarding academic degrees" (registered in the Register of State registration of regulatory legal acts No. 4990, published in the "Yuridicheskaya Gazeta" dated November 30, 2007, No. 184 (1387).

© 2012. RSE on REM "Institute of Legislation and Legal Information of the Republic of Kazakhstan" of the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan